

## **CONSULTATION QUESTIONS**

**1. Do you support the development of an MPA network in Scotland's Seas?**

Yes  No

We support the proposals for a network of Marine Protected Areas in Scotland's inshore and offshore waters, but believe more must be done to protect, connect and actively recover the health of our seas, which has suffered long-term decline over many generations.

### **Individual possible Nature Conservation MPAs**

**2. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Clyde Sea Sill* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**3. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *East Caithness Cliffs* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**4. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *East of Gannet and Montrose Fields* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**5. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Faroe-Shetland sponge belt* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**6. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Fetlar to Haroldswick* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**7. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Hatton-Rockall Basin* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**8. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Creran* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**9. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Sunart* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**10. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Sunart to the Sound of Jura* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

SSACN support the designation.

Management Options: Yes  No

SSACN support the reduction / limitation of mobile towed gear but are concerned that this is dependent on further discussions with the commercial sector – the precautionary principle should be adopted and a temporary ban should be implemented as ahead of any discussions.

SSACN support the removal / avoidance of bottom set nets and long-lines.

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

A healthy and productive sea is essential to the economy of coastal communities of the area. Ensuring an increase in biodiversity will generate

enhanced revenues from the sea angling, recreational marine activities and tourism sectors – all of which are important and substantial economic contributors to the areas fragile economy.

All of the above:

Yes  No

The Scottish Government has a legal obligation to achieve good environmental status in Scottish waters by 2020 and must be able to demonstrate a well-managed network of MPAs are in place by the end of 2016. MPAs should be regarded as integral to the achievement of healthy and productive seas and effective ecosystems management.

The current management proposals protect the status quo in most areas whereas we believe every effort should be made to regenerate biodiversity and would support strong management throughout MPA sites.

The Government needs to show that it is managing our seas for the benefit of everyone in Scotland and not just those who commercially benefit by extracting / depleting the very resources under threat.

**11. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Sween* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation:

Yes  No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes  No

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes  No

All of the above:

Yes  No

Comments

**12. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Lochs Duich, Long and Aish* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**13. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Monach Isles* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**14. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Mousa to Boddam* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**15. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *North-east Faroe Shetland Channel* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**16. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *North-west Orkney* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**



Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**17. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *North-west sea lochs and Summer Isles* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**18. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Noss Head* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**19. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Papa Westray* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**20. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Rosemary Bank Seamount* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**21. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Small Isles* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No

Comments

**22. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *South Arran* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation:

Yes  No

We agree with the location and designation of the proposed South Arran Marine Protected Area which we believe would be an integral part of an ecologically coherent Scottish MPA network.

The area proposed around the South of Arran will help the sea bed and sea life to recover, but will only be effective if bottom trawling and dredging is prohibited from the whole area.

Management Options:

Yes  No

Bottom towed trawls, dredgers and hydraulic gear should be excluded from the areas proposed by SNH plus a substantial exclusion limit to ensure the recovery of the nature conservation features throughout the proposed MPA.

Properly managed creeling, shellfish diving, and angling should be allowed.

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes  No

A healthy and productive sea is essential to the economy of coastal communities around Scotland.

Increased biodiversity and productivity will not only benefit commercial fishermen but will generate enhanced revenues from the sea angling, recreational marine activities and tourism sectors – all of which are important and substantial economic contributors to the economy of the area.

All of the above:

Yes  No

The Scottish Government has a legal obligation to achieve good environmental status in Scottish waters by 2020 and must be able to demonstrate a well-managed network of MPAs are in place by the end of 2016.

MPAs should be regarded as integral to the achievement of healthy and productive seas and effective ecosystems management.

The current management proposals protect the status quo in most areas whereas we believe every effort should be made to regenerate biodiversity and would support strong management throughout MPA sites.

The Government needs to show that it is managing our seas for the benefit

of everyone in Scotland and not just those who commercially benefit by extracting / depleting the very resources under threat.

**23. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for *The Barra Fan and Hebrides Terrace Seamount* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No

Comments

All of the above: Yes  No X

Comments

**24. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Turbot Bank* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation: Yes  No

Comments

Management Options: Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes  No X

Comments

All of the above:

Yes  No

Comments

**25. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Upper Loch Fyne and Loch Goil* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation:

Yes  No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes  No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes  No

Comments

**26. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *West Shetland Shelf (formerly Windssock)* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation:

Yes  No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes  No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes  No

Comments

**27. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Wyre and Rousay Sounds* possible Nature Conservation MPA?**

Designation:

Yes  No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes  No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes  No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes  No

Comments

## Choices to represent features in the MPA Network

**28. Recognising the scientific advice from JNCC included alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, ocean quahog and shelf banks and mounds in the Southern North Sea, do you have a preference or comments on the following combinations to represent these features, bearing in mind Turbot Bank will need to be designated to represent sandeel in this region:**

- Firth of Forth Banks Complex
- Turbot bank and Norwegian Boundary Sedimentary Plain
- Or Firth of Forth Banks Complex, Turbot bank and Norwegian Boundary Sedimentary Plain

Comments

**29. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessments for the preference you have indicated in the question above, regarding alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, ocean quahog and shelf banks and mounds in the Southern North Sea?**

Yes  No

Comments

**30. Recognising the scientific advice from JNCC included alternatives for representing the burrowed mud feature in the Fladens, do you have a preference or comments on the following combinations to represent these features, bearing in mind the part of Central Fladen (known as Central Fladen (Core)) containing tall seapen (*Funiculina quadrangularis*) will need to be designated to represent tall seapen in this region:**

- Central Fladen pMPA only
- The tall sea-pen component of Central Fladen, plus Western Fladen
- Or the tall sea-pen component of Central Fladen, plus South-East Fladen.

Comments



**31. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessments for the preference you have indicated in the question above, regarding alternatives for representing the burrowed mud feature in the Fladens?**

Yes  No X

Comments

**32. Recognising the scientific advice from JNCC included alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, offshore deep sea mud, and burrowed mud in OSPAR Regions III and V, do you have a preference or comments on the following combinations to represent these features:**

South-West Sula Sgeir and Hebridean slope  
Or Geikie slide and Hebridean slope

Comments

**33. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessments for the preference you have indicated in the question above, regarding alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, offshore deep sea mud, and burrowed mud in OSPAR Regions III and V?**

Yes  No X

Comments

## **Sustainability Appraisal**

**34. Do you have any comments on the Sustainability Appraisal of the MPA network as a whole?**

Yes  No

The current management proposals only protect the status quo in most areas and too many of them are dependent on further discussions with the commercial fishing sector.

In essence that invalidates many of the proposals put forward in the consultation, provides that sector with a 'virtual veto' and makes it impossible to determine the potential for sustainability.

## **Final Thoughts**

**35. On the basis of your preferences on which pMPAs should be designated, do you view this to form a complete or ecologically coherent network, subject to the completion and recommendations of SNH's further work on the 4 remaining search locations?**

Yes  No

Each MPA should be effectively managed to ensure recovery of all depleted species and habitats within a site that can benefit from spatial protection are adequately represented and appropriate measures are in place for each and every case.

Zonal management measures for single species / habitats are not enough, given the context of ecological decline documented by Scotland's Marine Atlas.

The network can only be considered ecologically coherent when sound, properly-resourced science demonstrates the ecological linkages between the different MPAs.

**36. Do you have any other comments on the case for designation, management options, environmental or socioeconomic assessments of the pMPAs, or the network as a whole?**

Yes  No

A healthy and productive sea is essential to the economy of coastal communities around Scotland. Increased biodiversity will not only generate enhanced revenues for the commercial sectors in but will significantly increase those from the sea angling, recreational marine activities and tourism sectors – all of which are important and substantial economic contributors to the fragile economies of many coastal communities where other commercial activities such as commercial fishing have seriously declined.

Far more work is required if the assessment of the potential socio-economic costs / benefits of having a well-managed marine environment are to be really credible – delaying any decision on the proposed Demonstration / Research MPAs means opportunities to develop practical experience / evidence in those areas are being delayed, if not lost altogether.

## Thank You.

### Marine Protected Areas Network Proposals Consultation



#### RESPONDENT INFORMATION FORM

Please Note this form **must** be returned with your response to ensure that we handle your response appropriately

##### **1. Name/Organisation**

Organisation Name

The Scottish Sea Angling Conservation Network

**Title** Mr  Ms  Mrs  Miss  Dr  *Please tick as appropriate*

Surname

Steve

Forename

Bastiman

## 2. Postal Address

22 Pitreavie Place

Kirkcaldy

Postcode KY2 6JX

Phone

01723871187

Email

contact@ssacn.org

## 3. Permissions - I am responding as...

Individual

/  Group/Organisation

Please tick as appropriate

- (a) Do you agree to your response being made available to the public (in Scottish Government library and/or on the Scottish Government web site)?

Please tick as appropriate  Yes  No

- (b) Where confidentiality is not requested, we will make your responses available to the public on the following basis

Please tick ONE of the following boxes

Yes, make my response, name and address all available

or

Yes, make my response available, but not my name and address

or

Yes, make my response and name available, but not my address

- (c) The name and address of your organisation **will be** made available to the public (in the Scottish Government library and/or on the Scottish Government web site).

Are you content for your **response** to be made available?

Please tick as appropriate  Yes  No

- (d) We will share your response internally with other Scottish Government policy teams who may be addressing the issues you discuss. They may wish to contact you again in the future, but we require your permission to do so. Are you content for Scottish Government to contact you again in relation to this consultation exercise?

Please tick as appropriate

Yes